

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

\* \* \* \* \*

In the matter of the investigation, on the	)	
Commission's own motion, into the electric	)	
supply reliability plans of Michigan's	)	Case No. U-18197
electric utilities for the years 2017 through 2021.	)	
_____	)	

At the January 12, 2017 meeting of the Michigan Public Service Commission in Lansing,  
Michigan.

PRESENT: Hon. Sally A. Talberg, Chairman  
Hon. Norman J. Saari, Commissioner  
Hon. Rachael A. Eubanks, Commissioner

**ORDER**

This order calls upon electric utilities regulated by the Commission, alternative electric suppliers, utility affiliates, and certain power supply cooperatives and associations to submit a self-assessment of their ability to meet their customers' expected electric requirements and associated reserves during the five-year period of 2017 through 2021.

Beginning in 1998, the Commission commenced annual investigations into the adequacy and reliability of the electric generation capacity for meeting customer requirements in the Consumers Energy Company (Consumers), DTE Electric Company (DTE Electric), and Indiana Michigan Power Company (I&M) service territories. In subsequent years, the Commission expanded the scope of the investigations to include, among other things, the availability of transmission capability, the effects of the companies' retail open access programs, affiliate dealings, the Customer Choice and Electricity Reliability Act, MCL 460.10 *et seq.*, expected changes in the

wholesale market for electricity in the Midwest, and the interconnection of merchant generating plants. In Case No. U-14087, the Commission again expanded its investigation to include all Michigan-regulated electric utilities, including member-regulated cooperatives.<sup>1</sup> In the December 19, 2013 order in Case No. U-17523, the Commission found that it should conduct a similar investigation that would span the three-year period of 2014 through 2016 due to the expected retirement of older generating units in the state associated with implementation of new air quality requirements. In the December 4, 2014 order in Case No. U-17751, the Commission extended the horizon to a five-year period in light of the capacity outlook and the time necessary to plan and arrange for new capacity supplies, including new generation and demand-side options.

As in prior years, Michigan electric utilities<sup>2</sup> and other load-serving entities (LSEs) should file assessments of their plans for meeting customer loads during the 2017 to 2021 timeframe. Midcontinent Independent System Operator, Inc. (MISO), PJM Interconnection (PJM), and providers of transmission services in Michigan are invited to file comments regarding issues that affect the role of transmission in ensuring reliability and capacity availability; and other interested persons are also invited to file comments.

Each assessment should include the LSE's expected peak demand and the resources available and committed to meet peak demand, including applicable regional transmission organization (RTO) requirements such as expected reserves by applying MISO's 2017-2018 planning year

---

<sup>1</sup> The Commission identifies these electric utilities as Consumers, DTE Electric, I&M, Alpena Power Company, Upper Peninsula Power Company, Wisconsin Electric Power Company, Wisconsin Public Service Corporation, Northern States Power Company, d/b/a Xcel Energy, and the following electric cooperatives: Alger-Delta Co-operative Electric Association, Cherryland Electric Cooperative, Cloverland Electric Co-operative, Great Lakes Energy Cooperative, Midwest Energy Cooperative, The Ontonagon County Rural Electrification Association, Presque Isle Electric & Gas Co-op, Thumb Electric Cooperative of Michigan, and HomeWorks Tri-County Electric Cooperative.

<sup>2</sup> By its December 9, 2016 order in Case No. U-18061, a new Michigan utility, Upper Michigan Energy Resources Corporation, has been formed.

reserve for each of the five years addressed by this order. MISO's 2017-2018 planning year under Module E of its tariff covers June 1, 2017, to May 31, 2018.<sup>3</sup> Each assessment should justify the expected reserve margin in light of the LSE's circumstances, including the reliability characteristics of its resource base and the characteristics and diversities of the customer load. Load forecasts should separately identify choice load and bundled load. Each assessment should also distinguish between in-state and out-of-state generation resources, and any applicable transmission service or capacity import limits, and analyze how this generation is expected to serve customer demand and meet applicable RTO requirements such as MISO Module E requirements.

Each assessment shall further provide details for each year regarding the actual deliverability of generation output and purchased power under peak operating conditions, and transmission capabilities and constraints or other factors such as pricing affecting deliverability and reliance on resources located in other RTOs or other resource zones within an RTO. Further, each assessment shall identify all supply side resources designated to meet reserve requirements for each year of the five year forecast – including generation units that are owned by the LSE affiliates or otherwise committed to serve the load, firm contract capacity supported by commitments of designated unit or system resources, and demand response or load curtailment measures – in sufficient detail (i.e., unit-level and contract-level information) to verify that no resource is being credited more than once toward the planning requirements of one or more load-serving entities. To the extent that the LSE plans to rely on the MISO capacity auction, other power purchase agreement (PPA) market purchases of capacity, or other capacity purchased from the market on an

---

<sup>3</sup> The Commission recognizes that MISO is considering changes that would institute seasonal capacity requirements instead of the current annual system; these changes are not in effect and thus are not addressed in this order.

as-needed basis to meet some or all of its needs, the LSE should address potential pricing risks or transmission availability risks.

Given that MISO is expected to collect and analyze similar information from LSEs in its footprint during 2017 through the Organization of MISO States (OMS)-MISO Resource Adequacy Survey and given that discrepancies may arise between MISO's results and what is reported to the Commission, the Commission also finds it appropriate for regulated electric utilities to share with the Commission their OMS-MISO survey submittals, including the balance sheet produced by MISO that summarizes each LSE's submittal as well as the LSE's updates to the balance sheet.<sup>4</sup> If these submittals occur after the initial filing deadline described below, the Commission directs utilities to supplement their filings in this docket with all survey information as that information is submitted or updated during 2017. The Commission has selected an initial response date that typically falls after the annual MISO planning resource auction. It is expected that, by requesting responses after the date of the annual MISO planning resource auction, the burden of compiling the assessments and addressing the confidentiality of some information will be somewhat eased.

If information is commercially sensitive or critical energy infrastructure information (CEII), it may be submitted to the Commission in confidence.<sup>5</sup> Any party wishing to do so may use the Protective Order attached hereto as Exhibit A for filing confidential information. This Protective

---

<sup>4</sup> With the passage of Public Act 341 of 2016, this is the last capacity assessment that requires only regulated electric utilities to file these reports. In the future, all LSEs will be required to make such filings.

<sup>5</sup> The submission of commercially sensitive information by any person will be treated as being voluntarily provided to the Commission under MCL 15.243(1)(f). Any person desiring to submit confidential commercial or financial information in this docket in a confidential manner shall contact the Commission's Executive Secretary for instructions. CEII information may be submitted in confidence under MCL 15.243(1)(d).

Order is patterned after the one adopted for use in Case No. U-17992, last year's capacity assessment docket. *See*, Exhibit A attached to the December 22, 2015 order in Case No. U-17992.

The Commission stresses the need for complete, accurate, and detailed reporting by LSEs. To facilitate the collection of comparable data for analysis, LSEs should use the uniformly formatted table provided by the Commission Staff in Case No. U-17751 with separate spreadsheet tabs for each season. The Commission also encourages LSEs and other interested persons to continue to submit narrative responses as they can provide helpful insights and commentary on the data for the Commission to consider.

The self-assessment reports should be filed with the Commission by April 21, 2017. Comments from interested persons regarding those self-assessment reports and/or the overall capacity outlook should be filed with the Commission by May 12, 2017.

The self-assessment reports required by this order and any comments filed by interested persons shall be submitted electronically through the Commission's E-Dockets Website at: [michigan.gov/mpscedockets](http://michigan.gov/mpscedockets). Requirements and instructions for filing can be found in the User Manual on the E-Dockets help page. Documents may also be submitted, in Word or PDF format, as an attachment to an email sent to [mpscedockets@michigan.gov](mailto:mpscedockets@michigan.gov). If you require assistance prior to e-filing, contact the Commission Staff at (517) 284-8090 or by e-mail at [mpscedockets@michigan.gov](mailto:mpscedockets@michigan.gov).

THEREFORE, IT IS ORDERED that:

A. By April 21, 2017, all Michigan-regulated electric utilities shall file an assessment of the utility's ability to meet its customers' expected electric requirements in the 2017 through 2021 timeframe, which addresses the topics outlined in this order. The assessments shall be augmented by Midcontinent Independent System Operator, Inc., balance sheet information as it is submitted,

received, or updated during the course of 2017 as part of the Organization of MISO States-Midcontinent Independent System Operator, Inc., survey.

B. All Michigan-regulated electric utilities shall provide the assessment using the uniformly formatted table developed by the Commission Staff in Case No. U-17751. The Commission Staff shall cooperate with all persons filing assessments and/or comments to facilitate the investigation being conducted in this docket. Specifically, the Commission Staff is directed to develop information regarding any unique circumstances or other positional risks that the Commission Staff suspects may be likely to adversely and disproportionately impact residents and businesses in any area of the state.

C. Alternative electric suppliers, including, but not limited to, the Michigan-regulated electric utility affiliate Wolverine Power Supply Cooperative, Inc., are requested to file similar assessments by April 21, 2017.

D. Midcontinent Independent System Operator, Inc., PJM Interconnection, American Transmission Company, LLC, the Michigan Electric Transmission Company, and International Transmission Company are requested to submit comments by May 12, 2017, on the issues that they believe are most relevant to this investigation.

E. Other interested persons wishing to file comments in response to the assessments or comment and/or suggestions regarding potential capacity needs in Michigan shall file those comments and/or suggestions by May 12, 2017.

F. The submission of commercially sensitive information by any person will be treated as being voluntarily provided to the Commission under MCL 15.243(1)(f). Any person desiring to submit confidential commercial or financial information in this docket in a confidential manner

shall contact the Commission's Executive Secretary for instructions, and may make use of the Protective Order attached hereto as Exhibit A.

G. Critical energy infrastructure information may be submitted in confidence under MCL 15.243(1)(d).

H. Any interested persons who obtain access to confidential information under the terms of a protective order and/or a nondisclosure agreement shall be required to file their responsive comments in this docket in a confidential manner.

I. The Commission Staff shall compile and analyze the information, coordinating with the applicable regional transmission organization as needed, and file in this docket, no later than June 30, 2017, a report on its review of the data and overall capacity outlook for the state and areas within the state.

The Commission reserves jurisdiction and may issue further orders as necessary.

MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

---

Sally A. Talberg, Chairman

---

Norman J. Saari, Commissioner

---

Rachael A. Eubanks, Commissioner

By its action of January 12, 2017.

---

Kavita Kale, Executive Secretary



STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

\*\*\*\*\*

In the matter of the investigation, on the	)	
Commission's own motion, into the electric	)	Case No. U-18197
supply reliability plans of Michigan's	)	
<u>electric utilities for the years 2017 through 2021.</u>	)	

**PROTECTIVE ORDER**

This Protective Order governs the use and disposition of Protected Material (as defined below) filed under seal by any person in this docket. This Protective Order describes the manner in which Protected Material is to be identified and treated and governs its ultimate disposition. Accordingly, IT IS HEREBY ORDERED:

1. This Protective Order shall govern the use of all Protected Material, so identified as required by Paragraph 11, made available for review, or produced, by or on behalf of the Producing Party to any Receiving Party or Reviewing Representative. Protected Material shall be used and disclosed by the recipient thereof solely in accordance with the terms and conditions of this Protective Order.
2. Protected Material for the purposes of this Protective Order means information designated as confidential and filed under seal in this docket by any person in response to the Commission's December 20, 2016 order. The Protective Order protects: (1) the Protected Material; (2) any copy or reproduction of the Protected Material made by any

person; and (3) any memorandum, handwritten notes, or any other form of information that copies, contains, or discloses Protected Material.

3. The information subject to this Protective Order does not include:

- a. Information lawfully known by the Interested Party or Reviewing Representative at the time of disclosure;
- b. Information that is or becomes available to the general public through no fault of an Interested Party or Reviewing Representative;
- c. Information received from a third party free to disclosure such information without restriction;
- d. Information that is independently developed by the Interested Party without the use of Protected Material furnished to the party;
- e. Information that is approved for release by written authorization of the provider of the Protected Material, but only to the extent of such authorization;
- f. Information that is required by law or regulation to be disclosed, but only to the extent and for the purposes of such required disclosure; or
- g. Information that is disclosed in response to a valid order of a court of competent jurisdiction or governmental body, requiring public disclosure and only to the extent of and for the purposes of such order.

4. “Producing Party” shall mean a person who discloses under the terms of this Protective Order all or a portion of the Protected Material that person has filed under seal in this docket in response to the Commission’s December 20, 2016 order. “Interested Person” shall mean a person who intends to file comments with the Commission in this

docket as provided for in the Commission's December 20, 2016 order, and who is represented by an attorney who has filed an appearance in this proceeding, or who is an individual who has filed an appearance in his or her own name, accompanied by a brief statement disclosing his or her interest in this proceeding. "Receiving Party" shall mean any Interested Person in this proceeding who requests or receives access to the Protected Material, subject to the requirement that each Reviewing Representative must sign a Nondisclosure Certificate.

5. "Reviewing Representative" shall mean a person who has signed and filed a Nondisclosure Certificate and who is:

- a. an attorney who has entered an appearance in this proceeding for a Receiving Party;
- b. an attorney, paralegal, or other employee associated for purposes of this case with an attorney described in 5a;
- c. an expert or employee of an expert retained by a Receiving Party for purposes of advising, preparing for, or filing comments in this proceeding;
- d. an employee or other representative of a Receiving Party with significant responsibility for this docket; or
- e. the Interested Person, if the Interested Person is an individual.

A Reviewing Representative is responsible for assuring that persons under his or her supervision and control comply with this Protective Order.

6. "Nondisclosure Certificate" shall mean a certificate substantially in the form of the certificate attached to this Protective Order by which a Reviewing Representative who has been granted access to Protected Material certifies his or her understanding that such access is provided pursuant to the terms of this Protective Order and that he or she agrees to be bound by it.

7. A Receiving Party may authorize access to and use of Protected Material by a Reviewing Representative identified by the Receiving Party as being necessary in order to analyze the Protected Material, including consultants employed by the Receiving Party, but only for the purposes of analyzing the issues, and preparing comments, or other motions or filings, in Case No. U-18197. Such persons may not release or disclose the content of Protected Material to any other person or use such information for any other purpose, including, but not limited to use for competitive purposes.

8. All persons authorized to review Protected Material, including copies or reproductions and copies of notes of Protected Material, must, before reviewing any Protected Material, sign a copy of the Nondisclosure Certificate which evidences an agreement by such person to be bound by the terms of this Protective Order. A copy of the executed Nondisclosure Certificate shall be provided to the Producing Party. By signing the Nondisclosure Certificate, a Receiving Party does not concede that confidential treatment would be appropriate in any other proceeding, or that they would agree to such treatment of similar documents in another proceeding except as provided in this Order. For both Producing Parties and Receiving Parties under this protective order, the treatment of

Protected Material in this proceeding is of no precedential effect for other proceedings and they reserve their right to dispute such treatment in other proceedings.

9. Protected Material shall remain the property of the Producing Party and shall only remain available to the Receiving Party until no later than the conclusion of any appeal of any final order issued by the Commission in this Case No. U-18197 proceeding. On or before the date specified by the preceding sentences, the Receiving Party shall return to the Producing Party all Protected Material in its possession or in the possession of its Reviewing Representatives, including all copies thereof and notes of Protected Material, or certify in writing that the Protected Material has been destroyed. The Receiving Party shall submit to the Producing Party written certification stating that all Protected Material and all copies thereof and all notes of Protected Material in its possession, care, custody, or control have been returned or destroyed. An attorney for a Receiving Party in Case No. U-18197 who has signed a Nondisclosure Certificate that does not require return or destruction of Protected Materials may retain a single copy of the docket entries in this proceeding along with any work product containing Protected Material, but shall maintain the confidentiality of all of this material as provided in this Protective Order and abide by the use restrictions in this Protective Order.

10. The parties to Case No. U-18197 retain the right to seek further restrictions on the dissemination of Protected Material to Interested Persons who have or may subsequently seek to participate or intervene in this proceeding.

11. Protected Material made available by the Producing Party shall be clearly marked by the Producing Party as Protected Material subject to this Protective Order, including by

labeling such items as “Confidential.” Any copies of Protected Material shall be physically designated as Protected Material by the Receiving Party or the person authorized by the Receiving Party to make the copy. Notes of Protected Material shall be physically marked as Protected Material by the person making the notes. All Protected Material in the possession of the Receiving Party shall be maintained in a secure place. Access to Protected Material shall be limited to persons authorized to have such access subject to the provisions of this Protective Order.

12. Even if no longer engaged in this proceeding, every person who has signed a Nondisclosure Certificate shall continue to be bound by the provisions of this Protective Order. The obligations under this Protective Order shall not be extinguished or nullified by entry of a final order in this case and shall be enforceable before the Commission or in a court of competent jurisdiction. To the extent Protected Material is not returned to the Producing Party or destroyed, it shall remain subject to this Protective Order.

13. If a Receiving Party with access to Protected Material desires to incorporate, utilize, refer to, or otherwise use Protected Material in comments, or in any other oral or written form in this proceeding, such Receiving Party shall only do so pursuant to procedures that will maintain the confidentiality of the Protected Material. For purposes of this Order, the following procedures are established:

a. Written submissions using Protected Material shall be filed in a sealed record, to be maintained by the Docket Section of the Commission in envelopes clearly marked on the outside, “CONFIDENTIAL – SUBJECT TO PROTECTIVE ORDER ISSUED IN CASE NO. U-18197.” Simultaneously, identical documents and materials, but with the

Protected Material redacted, shall be filed, offered, introduced, or otherwise disclosed in the usual manner for the submission of evidence or briefs.

b. Copies of the documents filed with the Commission that contain Protected Material, including the portions of comments, exhibits, transcripts, and briefs that refer to Protected Material, must be sealed and maintained in the Commission's files with a copy of the Protective Order attached.

14. It is intended that the Protected Material subject to this Protective Order should be shielded from disclosure by the Receiving Party only to the extent permitted by law. As stated in the Commission's December 20, 2016 order in Case No. U-18197 (p. 4), "[t]he submission of commercially sensitive information by any person will be treated as being voluntarily provided to the Commission under MCL 15.243(1)(f)," and "CEII [Critical Energy Infrastructure Information] information may be submitted in confidence under MCL 15.243(1)(d)." If any Receiving Party receives a request for disclosure of information under the Michigan Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.231 *et seq.*, and the request encompasses Protected Material covered by this Order, that party will notify the Producing Party within five (5) business days of the request and withhold disclosure of the Protected Material for the maximum time allowed under the law to permit the Producing Party the opportunity to pursue whatever legal action it deems appropriate, including injunctive relief, to prevent the Protected Material from disclosure.

15. The parties to Case No. U-18197 reserve the right to challenge whether a document or information is Protected Material and whether such information can be withheld under this Order. The provisions of this Protective Order shall not apply to a particular

document, or portion of a document, described in Paragraph 2 if a Party can demonstrate that it has been previously disclosed by the Producing Party on a non-confidential basis or meets the criteria set forth in Paragraph 3a through 3g. Before disclosing a particular document or portion of a document described in Paragraph 2, however, the Receiving Party must first provide reasonable notice to the Producing Party of its conclusion that the document or portion of a document is not subject to this Protective Order because of prior disclosure. The provisions of this Protective Order shall terminate as to the Protected Material described in Paragraph 2 to the extent that the content of such Protected Material is filed with a state, provincial, or federal agency and is not subject to protection from public disclosure, or is otherwise lawfully disclosed.

16. If a Receiving Party violates this Order by an improper disclosure or use of Protected Material, then that Receiving Party shall take all necessary steps to remedy the improper disclosure or use. This includes immediately notifying the Commission, the presiding officer (if any), and the Producing Party, in writing, of the identity of the person known or reasonably suspected to have obtained the Protected Material. Any Receiving Party that violates this Protective Order shall remain subject to this paragraph regardless of whether the Producing Party could have discovered the violation earlier than it was discovered. This paragraph of this Protective Order applies to both inadvertent and intentional violations. Nothing in this Protective Order limits the Producing Party's rights and remedies, at law or in equity, against any Receiving Party or person using Protected Material in a manner not authorized by this Protective Order, including the right to obtain injunctive relief to prevent violations of this Protective Order.



17. Upon motion filed by any party to Case No. U-18197, the Commission or any presiding officer designated by it may subsequently declare that the protected status of Protected Material should not be continued and immediately communicate that declaration to the Producing Party. Thereafter, this Protective Order shall cease to apply to such Protected Material unless, within twenty-one (21) days, the Producing Party files a pleading asserting that the information should continue to be protected and setting forth the basis for that assertion. The Producing Party shall bear the burden of proving that the asserted Protected Material is entitled to continuing protection from disclosure. If the Commission or presiding officer finds that an asserted Protected Material no longer qualifies for treatment as Protected Material, it shall remain subject to the protection afforded by this Order for twenty-one (21) days following the issuance of the Commission's order or the presiding officer's ruling.

18. Members of the Commission, the Commission Staff, and the Michigan Agency for Energy Staff acting as Commission Staff pursuant to Executive Order No. 2015-10, Section VII. D., assigned to assist the Commission with its deliberations in this proceeding shall have access to all Protected Material that is submitted to the Commission under seal.

STATE OF MICHIGAN  
BEFORE THE MICHIGAN PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

\*\*\*\*\*

In the matter of the investigation, on the	)	
Commission's own motion, into the electric	)	Case No. U-18197
supply reliability plans of Michigan's	)	
<u>electric utilities for the years 2017 through 2021.</u>	)	

NONDISCLOSURE CERTIFICATE

I hereby certify my understanding that access to Protected Material is provided to me pursuant to the terms and restrictions of the Protective Order issued in Case No. U-18197, that I have been given a copy of and have read the Protective Order, and that I agree to be bound by the terms of the Protective Order. I am aware that the Producing Party [ ] asserts that Protected Material, as defined in the Protective Order, includes information that is confidential. I understand that the substance of the Protected Material, any notes or other memoranda, or any other form of information that copies or discloses Protected Material, shall be maintained as confidential, shall not be disclosed to anyone other than in accordance with that Protective Order, and shall not be used for any purpose other than in connection with Michigan Public Service Commission Case No. U-18197.

Reviewing Representative

Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Title:  
Representing: